

ANNALI

di storia dell'esegesi

32/1
2015

RETHINKING
EARLY CHRISTIANITY

EDB

Contents

Presentation / Presentazione 7-9

Enrico Norelli, *L'Ascension d'Esaië est-elle vraiment un écrit unitaire? Une discussion avec Richard Bauckham* 11-37

The second part of the *Ascension of Isaiah* (Ch. 6-11) was first composed as an independent work (the *Vision of Isaiah*) by a group of Christian prophets who kept in high esteem ecstatic experiences related to obtaining revelations. This work expresses the Christology and soteriology of the group. After some time, the doctrines and the authority of those prophets were called into question by exponents of a non-charismatic ministry. Subsequently, a representative of the prophetic circle revamped the *Vision of Isaiah* and composed the first part of the *Ascension* (Ch. 1-5). This author framed the conflict between his prophetic group and the church authorities who refuted the already existing *Vision of Isaiah*. He also inserted in the narrative a new vision which, on the surface, looks identical to the one contained in Ch. 6-11, but which actually tells a different story. This hypothetical reconstruction is based upon the presence of deep theoretical differences between the two parts of the *Ascension*. The first part (Ch. 1-5) clearly refers to the second one (Ch. 6-11), while the contrary is not true, and the clear intention of Ch. 1-5 is to accept the authority of Ch. 6-11. At the same time, Ch. 1-5 focuses on new aspects and shows little interest for key issues of the older *Vision*.

La datazione dei Vangeli: una discussione sulle proposte di Pier Franco Beatrice, Dennis McDonald e Markus Vinzent

Claudio Gianotto, *La datazione degli scritti protocristiani. A proposito di due nuove ipotesi per la datazione dei vangeli canonizzati (P.F. Beatrice, 2006 e M. Vinzent, 2014)* 39-54

The traditional dating of most books of the New Testament to the second half of the first century is not without problems. This chapter analyzes and discusses two recent proposals regarding the dates of the canonized Gospels, particularly the Synoptics. In 2006, Pierfranco Beatrice (in *Novum Testamentum*) maintained that the formation of the Gospels (which were later canonized) was a process which took much longer than is usually estimated. He contends that Mark depended on some written version of Peter's memoirs, and also that Matthew, Luke and John were all dependent on another, older gospel, namely, the *Gospel of the Hebrews*, which was translated into Greek and Latin by Jerome. Then, in 2014, Markus Vinzent, in his book *Marcion and the Dating of the Synoptic Gospels*, suggested that the production of all four canonical Gospels was subsequent to Marcion's *euaggelion*.

Markus Vinzent, <i>Marcion's Gospel and the Beginnings of Early Christianity</i>	55-87
--	-------

The study of Marcion's Gospel has seen a renaissance over the past five years. While it was intensely discussed in the first half of the 19th century, in the 20th century it was heavily influenced by Adolf von Harnack's masterpiece *Marcion: Das Evangelium vom fremden Gott* (Leipzig, 1923, 2nd ed. 1924 = Darmstadt, 1960). Sparked by the work of Gerhard May and others, the long neglected question of the wording, content and authorship of Marcion's Gospel has resurfaced and been independently undertaken by a number of scholars (Matthias Klinghardt, Jason BeDuhn, Dieter Roth, Judith Lieu) utilizing different hermeneutical approaches. In recent months, the debate has intensified and attracted scholarly attention around the world. In the present article, I set out my own perspective on this topic, suggesting that Marcion was not only the author of his Gospel (insofar as "authorship" is rightly understood, as he himself did not put his name to this text), but that this text also represents the start of the gospel genre and serves as the *Vorlage* for the canonical gospels and a number of later attempts to imitate it.

Libri per una de-metafisicizzazione della storia del cristianesimo antico, a cura di Roberto Alciati

Roberto Alciati, <i>Introduzione</i>	89-98
Matteo Tubiana, <i>Studi cognitivi e ricerca biblica: il viaggio celeste di Paolo (2Cor 12,1-10)</i>	99-128
Luca Arcari, <i>Archivi, enunciati, strategie. Michel Foucault e una possibile archeologia delle "origini" cristiane</i>	129-152
Emiliano Rubens Urciuoli, <i>Disfare le cose fatte con le parole. Auto-lettura di Un'archeologia del "noi" cristiano</i>	153-167

This collection of essays contains papers presented at the "Annual Meeting on Christian Origins" held at the University Residential Centre of Bertinoro (October 2-5, 2014). They belong to the thematic session entitled "Methodological Questions (Memory, Cognitive Studies, Sociology, Anthropology)" and are aimed at promoting researches with different disciplinary backgrounds. The shared epistemological agenda of the studies hosted in this unit is a radical de-metaphysicization of the processes of creation, transmission, memorization, and consolidation/survival of religious representations produced by Jesus' followers in the Mediterranean world and in the Middle East between the first and third century C.E. These general issues are briefly described in the introduction by Roberto Alciati, and this is followed by an analysis of the book edited by I. Czachesz and R. Uro (*Mind, Morality and Magic: Cognitive Science Approaches in Biblical Studies*, Durham, 2013). The author, Matteo Tubiana, tries to apply a cognitive approach to the case of Paul's heavenly journey (2 Cor 12:1-10). The last two contributions are both dedicated to Emiliano Rubens Urciuoli's book (*Per un'archeologia del "noi" cristiano. Le "comunità immaginate" dei seguaci di Gesù tra utopie e territorializzazioni [I-II secolo e.v.]*, Milano, 2013). Luca Arcari highlights the theoretical background of Urciuoli's work, focusing on Foucault's archaeological method. Finally, Urciuoli himself ends the collection with a sort of auto-socio-analysis which gives further insight into the main topic of his research, namely early Christians' social organization of language and knowledge about the self.

Modern interpretations of Early Christianity

- Gianluca Piscini, *L'apologista Justin et Usbek: une possible citation patristique dans les Lettres Persanes* 169-182

This paper studies a probable reference to Justin (an ancient Greek apologist) in Montesquieu's *Lettres Persanes*. In letter 33, the Persian Usbek discusses the possibility of salvation for Christians. In my opinion, this passage (and especially the expression "*semence de nos dogmes*") turns against Justin's Christian conception of Λόγος σπερματικός. After a short presentation of ancient Christian apologetics and of Justin's thought, I will point out that Montesquieu had sufficient knowledge of patristic literature and also a copy of Justin's works in his library. Then, I will outline how Justin played a key role in the seventeenth century debate on the possibility for pagans to be saved ("*querelle de la vertu des païens*")—a problem that Montesquieu discussed in a lost work and which also functions as the real subject of letter 33. Finally, I will study letter 33 itself. I will show that the allusion to Justin strengthens the irony and the ambiguity of the text: precisely because of Usbek's use of Christian expressions, this letter challenges not only Christian, but also Muslim religious primacy.

- Cristiana Facchini, *Dall'eresia del liberalismo a quella del nazismo* 183-197

The article deals with the notion of "heresy" as it was applied since the early nineteenth century in order to understand the patterns of the history of Christianity and of the Church. Since the early modern period, the Lutheran Reformation was indicated as the main cause that subsequently produced the modern character of Western society. It was the Lutheran "heresy" that gave birth to the French revolution, liberalism, socialism, and modern "sectarianism." The same model was applied by Catholic theologians and intellectuals in the 1930s, after the rise of Nazism. The article offers some insight into the reasons and the shortcomings of this powerful theology of history.

- Luigi Walt, *L'origine delle origini. Jonathan Z. Smith e la storia naturale del cristianesimo* 199-216

Hailed at its publication as one of the most significant books of the "greatest pathologist in the history of religions" (so Ioan P. Culianu), Jonathan Z. Smith's *Drudgery Divine* still has not received an adequate critical reception in Italy, and this article is meant to move a first step in this direction. Throughout its five chapters, Smith's work combines a *pars destruens* and a *pars construens*: the former devoted to a fierce deconstruction of the first modern attempts to compare Early Christianity with the religious systems of Late Antiquity, the latter to a radical overhaul of the comparative method in the history of religions. The present article aims to provide a critical assessment of both these aspects, by studying the use and re-use of metaphors drawn from the natural sciences in the understanding of what we now call, tautologically, "Christian origins."

- Simon C. Mimouni, *Reply to Stephen J. Shoemaker. From a Senior Scholar to a Junior Scholar* 217-219

Discussioni di libri

- Enrico Norelli e Emanuela Prinzi Valli discutono il libro di Adriana Destro e Mauro Pesce, *La morte di Gesù. Indagine su un mistero*, Milano, Rizzoli, 2014 221-237

Marinella Perroni, *La Bibbia e le donne. Un progetto internazionale di teologia in prospettiva di genere* 239-245

Jean-Claude Haelewyck, *Une nouvelle revue gratuite online: Babelao. Electronic Journal for Ancient and Oriental Studies* 247-251

Book Reviews 253-263

Jonathan Z. Smith, *Magie de la comparaison. Et autres études d'histoire des religions* ("Histoire des religions", 1), eds. D. Barbu et N. Meylan, préface de P. Borgeaud, Genève, Labor et Fides, 2014 (Luigi Walt).

David A. Fiensy, *Christian Origins and the Ancient Economy*, Eugene, Cascade Books, 2014 (Facundo D. Troche).

Fabrizio Chiappetti, *La formazione di un prete modernista. Ernesto Buonaiuti e Il Rinascimento (1907-1909)* ("Studi e testi", 9), prefaz. di D. Menozzi, Urbino, Quattro Venti, 2012 (Giovanni Vian).

M. Beatrice Durante Mangoni, Dario Garribba, Marco Vitelli (a cura di), *Gesù e la storia. Percorsi sulle origini del cristianesimo. Studi in onore di Giorgio Jossa*, Trapani, Il pozzo di Giacobbe, 2015 (Mauro Pesce).

Ulrich Berges, *La predica e la lezione. L'interpretazione della Bibbia tra chiesa e università* ("Sguardi"), Bologna, EDB, 2014 (Mauro Pesce).

Rinaldo Fabris, Giuseppe Ghiberti, Ermenegildo Manicardi (a cura di), *Al primo posto le Scritture. Bibliisti italiani del Novecento* ("Studi del centro 'A. Cammarata'", 81), Caltanissetta-Roma, Salvatore Sciascia Editore, 2014 (Mauro Pesce).

P. Foster, A. Gregory, J.S. Kloppenborg, J. Verheyden, eds., *New Studies in the Synoptic Problem. Oxford Conference, April 2008. Essays in Honour of Christopher M. Tuckett*, Leuven, Peeters, 2011 (Mauro Pesce).

Books Received 265-268